



Early Journal Content on JSTOR, Free to Anyone in the World

This article is one of nearly 500,000 scholarly works digitized and made freely available to everyone in the world by JSTOR.

Known as the Early Journal Content, this set of works include research articles, news, letters, and other writings published in more than 200 of the oldest leading academic journals. The works date from the mid-seventeenth to the early twentieth centuries.

We encourage people to read and share the Early Journal Content openly and to tell others that this resource exists. People may post this content online or redistribute in any way for non-commercial purposes.

Read more about Early Journal Content at <http://about.jstor.org/participate-jstor/individuals/early-journal-content>.

JSTOR is a digital library of academic journals, books, and primary source objects. JSTOR helps people discover, use, and build upon a wide range of content through a powerful research and teaching platform, and preserves this content for future generations. JSTOR is part of ITHAKA, a not-for-profit organization that also includes Ithaka S+R and Portico. For more information about JSTOR, please contact support@jstor.org.

Modern Philology

VOLUME XV

December 1917

NUMBER 8

VERGIL'S *AENEID* AND THE IRISH *IMRAMA*: ZIMMER'S THEORY

The late Professor Zimmer's ingenious effort to show that the *imram* literature, which arose in Ireland in the seventh or eighth century, came into being as a result of direct imitation of the account of the adventures of Aeneas (*Aeneid* iii-v)¹ appears to have received but passing notice. Some students who have taken cognizance of the theory have apparently been somewhat skeptical as to its validity.² The problem is of interest in connection with studies in the classical origin of mediaeval types of literature, and has to do with a *genre* which is important because of the inherent charm of the stories

¹ H. Zimmer, *Zeitschrift für deutsches Alterthum (ZfDA)*, XXXIII (1889), 328 ff. The argument is one feature of Zimmer's efforts to stress the extent and significance of foreign influences upon early Irish literature. For a bibliography of Zimmer's works, as well as for references to other documents connected with early Irish literature referred to in this paper, see the excellent work of R. I. Best, *Bibliography of Irish Philology and of Printed Irish Literature*, Dublin, 1913 (*Bibliog.*). For supplementary references to Zimmer's work see *Zeitschrift für celtische Philologie (C.Z.)*, VIII (1912), 593-94; IX (1913), 87 ff.; and *Revue Celtique (R.C.)*, XXXI (1910), 411.

² Alfred Nutt (*Voyage of Bran* [London, 1895], I, 166, n. 2), A. C. L. Brown (*Harvard Studies and Notes [HSN]*, VIII [1903], 57, n. 1), Alfred Schulze (*Zeitschrift für romanische Philologie*, XXX [1906], 257), and W. A. Nitze (*Modern Philology*, XI [1913-14], 465, n. 1), are noncommittal in their references to Zimmer's theory. Nutt's and Brown's theories of the composition of *Maelduin*, however, are clearly inimical to Zimmer's position, and in a recent paper ("From Cauldron of Plenty to Grail," *Mod. Phil.*, XIV [1916-17], 388, n. 6), Brown says, "Zimmer . . . urged with little plausibility that this (*Maelduin*) and later *imrama* grew up under the influence of Vergil's *Aeneid*." To the skepticism toward Zimmer's theory indicated in class lectures by Professor T. P. Cross is due the interest leading to the present discussion. To Professor Cross I am also indebted for a number of valuable references and suggestions.

included and because of the wide influence exerted by one of them, the legend of Saint Brendan.¹

The purpose of this paper is to attempt to show the unconvincing nature of Zimmer's arguments in favor of Vergilian influence. No effort is made to support, in any comprehensive way, the alternative hypothesis that the *genre* is an outgrowth, not only of Celtic material, but of native narrative methods.

The *imram* is a sea-voyage tale in which a hero, accompanied by a few companions, wanders about from island to island, meets Otherworld wonders everywhere, and finally returns to his native land. The stories commonly included in the *imram* canon are *Imram Brain maic Febail*, "The Voyage of Bran, son of Febal"; *Imram Curaig Maelduin*, "The Voyage of the Boat of Maelduin"; *Imram Curaig hua Corra*, "The Voyage of the Boat of the Húi Corra"; *Imram Brendain*, "The Voyage of Brendan"; and *Imram Snedgusa ocus mac Riagla*, "The Voyage of Snedgus and Mac Riagla."² To this list should be added *Echtra Clerech Choluim Cille*, "The Adventures of the Clerics of Columb Cille," a variant of *Snedgus and Mac Riagla*. The first in the list, *Imram Brain*, lacks the distinctive *imram* trait of the stressing of the adventurous voyage, and is perhaps best regarded as an earlier form of the Otherworld journey, which is chiefly concerned with the hero's adventures in the land of women. It is evident from Zimmer's arguments that he does not regard *Bran* as a true *imram*, and Alfred Nutt³ and A. C. L. Brown⁴ have apparently taken a similar view. *Bran* is older than the true *imrama*, as it dates, according to Zimmer⁵ and Kuno Meyer,⁶ from the seventh century. The oldest complete *imram* is probably *Maelduin*, which belongs to the seventh or eighth century.⁷ It should be noted,

¹ The great influence of the Brendan legend upon continental mediaeval literature is reflected in the many studies of this *imram* (see *Bibliog.*, p. 115). Interesting speculations concerning the possible influence of the story upon early voyages of discovery, notably those of Christopher Columbus, appear in a paper by T. J. Westropp, *Proceedings, Royal Irish Academy*, XXX (1912-13), 223 ff. Cf. Gustav Schirmer, *Zur Brendanus-Legende*, Leipzig, 1888.

² *Bibliog.*, pp. 115-16; Westropp, *op. cit.*, p. 226; Schirmer, *op. cit.*, pp. 18 ff., etc.

³ *Voyage of Bran*, I, "The Happy Otherworld."

⁴ *HSN*, VIII, 57-58; cf. also *ibid.*, p. 30, n. 2.

⁵ *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 261.

⁶ *Voyage of Bran*, I, xvi.

⁷ Zimmer's conclusions, based largely on linguistic evidence, are supplemented by Nutt's convictions based on the folklore aspect of the question. These conclusions quite

however, that Zimmer, on linguistic evidence, regards *Húi Corra* as preserving in its earlier sections the text of a much older version, which probably antedated *Maelduin*.¹ The later *imrama*, *Snedgus and Mac Riagla*, *Clerics of Columb Cille*, *Brendan*, and *Húi Corra* (in its present form) show increasing effects of the Christianizing process apparent in *Maelduin*, and become associated with the "visions."²

A discussion of Zimmer's argument must be preceded by summaries of three stories chiefly concerned.

IMRAM BRAIN MAIC FEBAIL³

A mortal prince, Bran son of Febal, awakened by fairy music, learns, from a beautiful young woman, of the "glorious island" where all is beauty and joy and lasting life. The lady vanishes. Bran and twenty-seven companions set sail to seek the delightful place. They reach the Isle of Laughter, where one of Bran's men is irresistibly drawn into the circle of laughing folk. His friends cannot coax him away. The supernatural Manannan, son of Ler, directs them to the Island of Women. One hundred and fifty islands are mentioned as part of this fairy realm, but only one is visited.

"They saw the leader of the women at the port. Said the chief of the women: 'Come hither on land, O Bran son of Febal! Welcome is thy advent!' Bran did not venture to go on shore. The woman throws a ball of thread to Bran straight over his face. Bran put his hand on the ball, which clave to his palm. The thread of the ball was in the woman's hand, and she pulled the coracle towards the port. Thereupon they went into a large house, in which was a bed for every couple, even thrice nine beds. The food that was put on every dish vanished not from them. It seemed a year to them that they were there—it chanced to be many years. No savour was wanting to them."

Bran's kindred plead with the hero to return to Ireland, but Bran's mistress warns them against departure. Seeing them intent on going, she cautions them against touching the soil of their native land and directs them to recover the companion lost on the Isle of Laughter. They reach Ireland and find that they are remembered only by virtue of an ancient tale of their voyage. One of the crew leaps from the coracle to the shore and immediately becomes a heap of ashes. Bran tells the assembly on the shore of his wanderings, and returns to the sea. "And from that hour his wanderings are not known."

clearly dispose of the notion that *Maelduin* is later than *Brendan*, a view held by a number of writers: Stokes, *R.C.*, IX (1888), 450; F. Lot in D'Arbois de Jubainville's *Cours de littérature celtique*, V, 451-52. The opposing views are discussed by César Boser, *Romania*, XXII (1893), 578 ff.

¹ *Op. cit.*, p. 201.

² On this point see C. S. Boswell, *An Irish Precursor of Dante* (London, 1908), p. 120.

³ Summarized from the translation by Kuno Meyer in *The Voyage of Bran*.

IMRAM CURAIG MAELDUIN¹

Ailill Ocar has been killed by coast plunderers. His posthumous son, Maelduin, is reared at court with the three sons of the queen and is kept in ignorance of his real parentage. Taunted one day about his unknown father, the boy coaxes from the queen an explanation, is taken to his real mother, and learns that his father had been chief of the tribe of Owenaght of Ninus. With his three foster-brothers Maelduin goes to his father's former kingdom, and is welcomed by the people.

While casting stones one day over the charred remains of the church of Dooclone, Maelduin is taunted for not revenging his father's death. Learning now of the murder, the young hero is fired with a desire for vengeance. The culprits are said to have a rendezvous a long way off over the ocean. Maelduin goes to Corcomroe to the druid Nuca to seek advice about building a currach for the trip and to ask a protective charm. He receives full instructions: he is told the exact day on which to begin the construction of his boat and the exact day on which to begin the voyage, and is enjoined to have a crew of sixty men, neither more nor less. After the boat has left the land the three foster-brothers, for some reason not included in the party, ask permission to accompany Maelduin. Mindful of the druid's words, the hero refuses the request, whereupon the importunate foster-brothers, reckless of their lives, swim after the boat. Maelduin in mercy takes them aboard.

Episode 1: Isle of the Murderers. Shortly after midnight two small fortified islands are reached, from which proceed sounds of revelry. Maelduin overhears one boast of his feat in killing Ailill and of the son's failure to exact vengeance. A squall at sea prevents landing and the currach is blown far away. The voyagers cease rowing and let the boat drift whither it please God. The foster-brothers are blamed for the ill luck.

Episode 2: Isle of Enormous Ants. Three days later, while casting lots to determine who shall explore an island, the men see a swarm of enormous ants, the size of foals, on their way to the currach, and flee.

Episode 3: Isle of Great Birds. A high terraced island. Many great birds in the trees. The crew eat their fill of the birds and take a supply on board.

Episode 4: Horselike Monster. A huge, horselike beast tries to lure them to land and pelts them with pebbles as they retire.

Episode 5: Demons' Horse Race. A great flat island, showing vast hoofmarks. Enormous nuts on the ground. From the boat the crew observe a noisy horse race, and think there is here a meeting of demons.

¹ Summarized from the translation of Whitley Stokes, *R.C.*, IX (1888), 447-95, and X (1889), 50-95. The story appears in whole or in part in four manuscripts: the Book of the Dun Cow ([LU], before 1106); the Yellow Book of Lecan ([YBL], fourteenth and fifteenth centuries); Harleian 5280 ([H], fifteenth century); and Egerton 1782 (fourteenth and fifteenth centuries). YBL and H contain verse paraphrases which are not printed or translated by Stokes in *R.C.*, but which may be found in *Anecdota from Irish Manuscripts*, I (Dublin, 1907), 50 ff.

Episode 6: Empty Banquet Hall. Hungry and thirsty after a week's rowing, the voyagers discover a high island. On the shore is a large house. A subaqueous door is closed by a valve of stone through an opening in which the waves fling hosts of salmon. In the house the men notice beds, food, and drink. They dine, thank God, and depart.

Episode 7: The Wondrous Fruit. Passing a wood-rimmed island, Maelduin seizes a rod from a tree. Three days later the rod bears a cluster of three apples, each apple sufficing the crew for food during forty days.

Episode 8: Feat-performing Beast. A huge beast races about a stone-fenced island. Halting on a height, it performs various feats, such as turning about in its skin. It flings stones at the men as they flee.

Episode 9: Fighting Horses. On this island the ground is bloody. Fierce horses are biting pieces from one another's sides.

Episode 10: Fiery Beasts and Golden Apples. Swinelike animals strike trees with their hind legs to shake down golden apples. The beasts retire, and birds come swimming about and partake of the fruit. The earth is hot, owing to the presence of the magic animals in the caverns; nevertheless, the men gather many apples, which forbid hunger and thirst.

Episode 11: The Guardian Cat. Again in hunger, the voyagers reach a small island containing a fort surrounded with a high white rampart. Outside the fort is a large house inhabited only by a small cat. In a gorgeously furnished room the men find food prepared. After the feast the "third" foster-brother attempts to carry away a necklace, but the cat leaps through him like a fiery arrow, and the thief is turned to ashes. Maelduin placates the cat, spreads the ashes on the sea, and departs "praising and magnifying God."

Episode 12: Black and White Sheep. A brazen palisade bisects the island. On one side are white sheep; on the other, black. Every sheep flung across the palisade by the giant herdsman changes color to correspond to its new environment. Rods which Maelduin casts ashore also change color. He departs in fear.

Episode 13: Giant Herdsman. Here are magic swine, enormous calves, and a burning river. Across a mountain a huge herdsman is seen guarding great hornless oxen. He remonstrates with an intruder from the boat. (This incident is apparently incomplete.)

Episode 14: Miller of Hell. A hideous miller grinds everything grudgingly given, amounting to half the grain of Ireland.

Episode 15: Isle of Weeping. A second foster-brother is here drawn into the charmed circle of weeping human beings, and is lost.

Episode 16: Isle of Four Fences. The four compartments of this isle are occupied by kings, warriors, queens, and maidens. One of the maidens welcomes the voyagers and gives them drink and food having any desired savour. Intoxicated by the drink, the mortals sleep three days. When they awake, in their boat at sea, the isle has disappeared.

Episode 17: The Chaste Maiden. A barrier consisting of a glass bridge which falls backward as visitors try to ascend it protects a fortress. A woman comes from the fortress and fills her pail from a magic fountain at the foot of the bridge. Magic music lulls the mortals to sleep. When the maiden reappears she is asked to become Maelduin's mistress. She replies, "Marvelously valuable do I deem Maelduin." The third day she again refuses the proffer of love, promising a definite answer the next day; but when the morrow dawns the men again find themselves alone at sea.

Episode 18: Chanting Birds. The singing of birds here suggests the chanting of psalms.

Episode 19: Lonely Pilgrim. A lonely shipwrecked Irish pilgrim inhabits a wooded isle which has miraculously grown from a single sod. The birds are the souls of the pilgrim's kindred who are awaiting doomsday. The old man, clad only in his hair, is fed daily, by angels, with half a cake, a slice of fish, and liquor from a magic well. There are three days of guesting, after which the old man prophesies, "Ye shall all reach your country save one man."

Episode 20: Magic Fountain. A white isle with a golden rampart is inhabited by an old cleric clad only in his hair. He is fed from a magic fount which yields whey or water on Fridays and Wednesdays, milk on Sundays and ordinary feast days, and ale on the feast days of the apostles, of Mary, and of John the Baptist. The men eat a half-cake and a piece of fish, drink from the magic fount, and fall into a heavy sleep. There are three days of guesting before the cleric orders the visitors to go.

Episode 21: Savage Smiths. The voyagers hear the sound of anvils and hear smiths on an isle talking of the strangers' approach. Turning the stern of their boat toward sea to conceal retreat, the men flee. The chief smith casts a molten mass at the boat, making the sea boil.

Episode 22: Sea of Glass. Maelduin passes over a beautiful magic sea resembling green glass.

Episode 23: Cloudlike Sea and Buried Country. In this underground realm appears a huge beast in a tree. Other animals are near by. The beast frightens away an armed man and seizes an ox. The frightened Irishmen hurry away.

Episode 24: Cliffs of Water and Terrified Islanders. At the approach of the party the inhabitants exclaim, "It is they." A woman pelts them with large nuts. The screams cease as the voyagers retire.

Episode 25: Water-Arch and Salmon. Salmon fall from an arch of water spanning an isle. Maelduin is thus supplied with food.

Episode 26: Silver Column and Net. Rising from the water is a high silver column. From the summit flies a silver net reaching to the sea. Diuran, one of the crew, cuts a piece of net as a souvenir. A voice from the summit speaks in an unknown tongue.

Episode 27: Island on Pedestal. A subaqueous door supplies the only entrance to this strange isle. A plow is seen on top of the island.

Episode 28: The Amorous Queen. A large island with a fortress and a great plain. Seventeen grown girls are seen preparing a bath. Maelduin and his men sit on a hillock opposite the fortress. A gorgeously attired woman approaches on horseback, dismounts, goes into the fortress, and enters the bath. A girl welcomes Maelduin's party in the name of the queen. The men enter, bathe, and go into the feast hall. After the feast the queen takes Maelduin to her bed, the companions pairing off with the seventeen daughters. Next morning the visitors are invited to remain, the queen promising them immortality and perennial joys. She explains that when her husband, the king, died she assumed the reign, and every day judges the people in the plain. The visitors remain three months, which seem three years. Maelduin reluctantly yields to the request of his men to return to Ireland; but when he attempts to leave, the queen throws after him a magic clew, which adheres to the hero's hand. The queen thus draws the boat back to the shore. After another long stay the incident is repeated. On the next occasion, Maelduin, accused of insincerity by his companions, has another catch the clew, cuts off the engaged hand, and throws it into the sea. The party escapes, and the queen sets up a great cry.

Episode 29: Intoxicating Fruit. Maelduin makes wine from berries growing on the next isle visited. The wine is so strong that it must be diluted with water.

Episode 30: Mystic Lake and Great Bird. A small church, a fortress, a forest, and a lake are features of this island, which is inhabited only by an old cleric, clothed in his hair, who says he is the fifteenth man of the community of Brennan of Birr, who had gone on an ocean pilgrimage and settled here. A great bird bearing a branch with grapelike berries alights on a hill near the lake. At noons two great eagles come and pick lice from the big bird's plumage, crush the berries, and make a red foam in the lake. The huge bird bathes. The next day the attendant birds sleek up the plumage of the great bird and depart. At the end of the third day the great bird flies away with its youth renewed. Diuran the Rhymer boldly plunges into the lake and sips the water. Thereafter his eyes were strong, he lost neither tooth nor hair, and suffered no weakness.

Episode 31: Isle of Laughing. The third foster-brother is lost in a group of laughing folk.

Episode 32: Isle of the Blest. A fiery rampart revolves about an island whereon are beautiful human beings with golden vessels and garments.

Episode 33: The Hermit of Sea Rock. A hermit clothed only in his hair is prostrating himself on a rock in the midst of the sea. He proves to be a dishonest church cook from Torach. He had been led to penitence by the voice of a pious corpse, and had undertaken a penitential sea voyage. After

miraculously escaping demons, he was cast upon this rock, which gradually grew in size. He had been miraculously supplied with food and drink, the latter improving in quality after seven years. He feeds the visitors and prophesies that they will reach home after finding the slayer of Maelduin's father, whom Maelduin is warned to forgive.

Episode 34: Signs of Home. An island with cattle and sheep is visited. An Irish falcon appears and the voyagers follow it.

Episode 35: Isle of the Murderers. Again the adventurers overhear the murderers speaking of Maelduin. They report him dead, but would welcome him should he appear. The hero makes himself known and he and his men receive new garments. They tell of their wanderings and of the marvels God has shown them, "according to the word of the sacred poet, '*haec olim meminisse iuvabit.*'" After the return to Ireland, Diuran places the piece of silver net on the altar at Armagh.

"Now Aed the Fair, chief sage of Ireland, arranged this story as it standeth here, and he did so for delighting the mind and for the folk of Ireland after him."

IMRAM CURAIG HUA CORRA¹

A prosperous Connaught man, named Conall the Red, and his wife, Caerdeg, daughter of a cleric, are childless. They "fast upon" the Devil and devote themselves to him. Three sons are born in one night and are given "heathen baptism." They are carefully nourished and are kept in ignorance of their preordained diabolic connections. One day they overhear older persons speak of the consecration of the boys to the Devil, and decide to be about their master's business. For a year they burn churches and kill clerics, finally visiting their grandfather. In the night one of the three, Lechan, is shown a vision of heaven and hell. The boys repent and are told to rebuild the destroyed churches. They perform this labor, and are seized one day with a longing to explore the wonders of the sea and to seek heaven across the waves.

As the adventurers are about to embark, a company of entertainers arrives, one of whom, the buffoon, wishes to join the Húi Corra. He is refused permission until he pleads "for God's sake," whereupon he is received, naked. The men commit their cause to God and the winds, and drift westward. They reach the Isle of Grieving Men, where one of the crew is lost. By visiting the Isle of Fragrant Apples they are freed from appetite, wound and disease, and pass on to the Isle of Gaiety, where a second companion is lost. They see many wonders: isle of one foot, rainbow river, silver pillar, isle of cleric Dega, isle of living and dead, flagstones of hell, isle of brazen palisade, wonderful birds, sea-rivers, isle of the harper, isle of Sabbath-desecrator, miller of hell, horse of fire, isle of dishonest smiths and

¹ Summarized from Stokes' translation, *R.C.*, XIV (1893), 22-63.

braziers, fiery giant, fiery sea of serpents and men's heads, isle of rest, community of St. Ailbe, psalm singer, solitary elder, and a deserter disciple of Christ. The last-named is an Irish cleric who predicts the future fortunes of the party. In the island of Britain is to be left a gillie from whom the bishop of Rome is to learn the story of the voyage of the boat of the sons of Corra. "And so it happened."

Imram Snedgusa ocus maic Riagla,¹ *Echtra Clerech Choluim Cille*,² and *Imram Brendain*³ do not require summary here. The several *imrama* are similar in general structure, and are interrelated through the inclusion of similar episodic matter and through the common use of many stock motives of Celtic traditional literature. *Maelduin* and *Bran*, for instance, have the isle of laughter and the Otherworld mistress who draws her lover to her isle by a ball of thread. *Maelduin* and *Húi Corra* have the isle of laughter, the isle of weeping, the miller of hell, the woman drawing water at the magic fount, the wonderful apples, the isle of four compartments, the pedestal island, the rainbow river, and the silver pillar. The hero *Maelduin* is specifically referred to in *Húi Corra*.⁴ *Maelduin* and *Brendan* have the isle of singing birds, walled islands, and monsters. *Húi Corra* and *Brendan* have the buffoon who implores "for God's sake." *Bran* and *Brendan* have the four-footed island, the birds that sing the hours, and the mention of "one hundred and fifty" isles.⁵

Zimmer admits that the material in these stories is drawn mainly from Celtic sources.⁶ He holds that the *imram* as a narrative type, however, is due to the influence of the *Aeneid*.

The suggestion of the great German scholar receives some support from the fact that the cultural background of the Irish storytellers of the sixth and following centuries was such that a borrowing from the classics was entirely possible. The authors of the time not

¹ The YBL text is printed with a translation and notes by Stokes, *R.C.*, IX (1888), 14-25. A German translation appears in R. Thurneysen, *Sagen aus dem alten Irland* (Berlin, 1901), pp. 127-30.

² YBL text ed. and trans., Stokes, *R.C.*, XXVI (1905), 130-67.

³ Text from the Book of Lismore printed and translated by Stokes, *Lives of Saints from the Book of Lismore* (Oxford, 1890), pp. 99-116 (text), and 247-61 (translation).

⁴ *R.C.*, XIV (1893), 45.

⁵ Similar comparisons have been made by Zimmer, Nutt, Brown, and Westropp, in the works cited; and by Stokes, *R.C.*, XIV, 24.

⁶ *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 331. A partial enumeration of parallels between material in the *imrama* and that in other Celtic literature may be found in the discussions of Nutt, Brown, Westropp, and Zimmer.

only inherited a wealth of native narrative material and a well-developed artistic tradition, but had also a background of Christian and classical learning. It seems established that after the flight of scholars from Continental Europe before the barbarian invaders of the fifth century, Ireland became the repository of classical learning for Western Europe and a center for the fostering and dissemination of Christian culture. A little later came a period of great missionary activity, and Ireland seems to have been largely responsible for the re-Christianizing of Europe. For several centuries the fame of Irish culture was great.¹ That the Irish universities in which the Christian writers studied gave considerable training in the classics may be admitted.² Professor Meyer has pointed out also that the Irish scholars, having received classical learning at a time when it was the natural study of every educated person, were not troubled as to the fitness of classical pagan literature for Christian scholars by any scruples such as disturbed their Continental brethren.³ On the popularity of the *Aeneid* in Ireland Zimmer has assembled interesting evidence.⁴ *Imram Maelduin* itself actually quotes Vergil;⁵ but the passage may of course be an insertion by a transcriber.

The existence of this Christian and classical culture, however, was not inimical to the preservation of the pagan lore of pre-Christian Ireland. The confusion of pagan and Christian conceptions in

¹ On this general subject see Zimmer's illuminating treatise, "Ueber die Bedeutung des irischen Elements für die mittelalterliche Cultur," *Preussische Jahrbücher*, LIX (1887), 27-59. This study has been translated by Jane L. Edmonds, *The Irish Element in Medieval Culture*, New York, 1891. See also Professor Kuno Meyer's more recent study, *Learning in Ireland in the Fifth Century and the Transmission of Letters* (Dublin, 1913), and Taylor, *Classical Heritage of the Middle Ages* (New York, 1901), esp. pp. 44 ff.

² Zimmer, *Irish Element*, pp. 19 ff.; Meyer, *Learning in Ireland*, pp. 11, and 26, n. 35. For a negative view of the knowledge of Greek in Ireland, outweighed, however, by the more authoritative utterances of Professor Meyer, see M. Esposito, "The Knowledge of Greek in Ireland during the Middle Ages," *Studies*, I, No. 4, December, 1912.

³ *Learning in Ireland*, p. 12.

⁴ *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 326-27. Zimmer regards the famous St. Gall manuscript containing a fragment of Vergil's work as an Irish document carried to the Continent by Irish scholars; he calls attention to the fame of Ruman mac Colman, "The Irish Vergil"; and he cites the frequency of the appearance of the name *Fe(i)rgil* in the *Annals of the Four Masters* as a testimony of the popularity of the great Roman poet. Zimmer's later attempt to identify the Irish name *Fechertne* with the name *Vergil* in an effort to show that the fifth-century Gaulish grammarian "Virgilius Maro" had visited Ireland (*Sitzungsber. der kgl. preuss. Akad.*, X [1910], 1056 ff.) has been shown by Professor Meyer (*Learning in Ireland*, p. 24, n. 19) to be based upon a wrong derivation of the Irish name.

⁵ *R.C.*, X, 92.

much early Irish literature,¹ and indeed the very survival of the enormous mass of pagan material through the centuries of Christian transcribing testify sufficiently to the kindness with which the learned Christian writers looked upon their inheritance of pagan Celtic tradition. A resort to native narrative models in a story consisting in the main of native materials would seem, therefore, at least equally as natural on the part of an early *imram* writer as a resort to a foreign model.²

The possible presence in the *imrama* of classical reminiscence in the handling of episodic detail demands notice. The significance of such classical material depends largely upon its extent and upon the closeness with which it approaches its supposed classical sources. To be of much use in supporting Zimmer's theory, parallels should be numerous and close. Zimmer's argument assumes that the Vergilian influence had had its full effect on the formation of the type by the time *Maelduin* was completed. Classical reminiscence in the other *imrama*, all of which are later than *Maelduin*, could therefore give little support to Zimmer's contention. A few parallels between *Maelduin* and the classics have been cited, some of which at least are too remote to be significant.

Stokes³ compares Calypso's words, "I loved and cherished him [Odysseus], and often said that I would make him an immortal, young forever," with the speech of the amorous queen in *Maelduin* (Episode 28), "Stay here, and age will not fall on you, but the age that ye have attained. And lasting life ye shall have always; and what came to you last night shall come to you every night without any labor." The parallel is interesting in connection with speculations concerning possible common origins for conceptions appearing

¹ An example is the use of the term *tír inna m-béo* in both the pagan sense (the land of living ones) and in the Christian sense (*terra repromissionis*): Zimmer, *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 287-88; Plummer, *Vitae Sanctorum Hiberniae* (Oxford, 1910), I, clxxxii, n. 11; Nutt, *op. cit.*, pp. 226-27.

² A summary of an unpublished paper presented before the Modern Language Association in 1909 on "Classical Tradition in Medieval Irish Literature," by Dr. E. G. Cox, reads thus: "Despite the wide acquaintance possessed by the medieval Irish with classical literature and traditions, their narrative methods, subject-matter, and spirit remained comparatively unaffected. Rather, the balance of influence inclines the other way. The causes lie perhaps in the stability of the Irish style of narrative, in the recognized position of the bardic profession, and in the lenient attitude adopted by the clerics towards the myths and tales of their countrymen." (*Publications*, XVIII [1910], Appendix, xxiii.)

³ *R.C.*, IX, 449.

in both Greek and Celtic tradition; but since the conferring of immortality upon mortal lovers by their Otherworld mistresses is a stock feature of stories dealing with the Otherworld,¹ the suggestion of direct indebtedness in this case could carry little weight. Stokes' parallel between the incidents of the savage smiths in *Maelduin* (Episode 21), and the Cyclops in the *Odyssey* is somewhat more striking, yet cannot be regarded as proof of direct borrowing.² The existence of like situations in classical literature and in Irish stories of a similar class may, on the other hand, suggest a possible primitive store of legend from which both Greeks and Celts drew.

Other comparisons suggested by Stokes, obviously less plausible as indications of borrowing, may be enumerated without comment. Possible parallels in Lucian and Megasthenes are cited for such details as the necessity of tempering the wine of the intoxicating fruit (Episode 29), the enormous nuts (Episode 24), the huge ants (Episode 2), the beasts which shake fruit trees with their tails (Episode 10), and the ox-eating serpent (Episode 23). Zimmer calls attention to the apparent influence of the Phoenix legend on Episode 30. C. S. Boswell in his book on the vision of St. Adamnan³ suggests *Aeneid* vi. 642-43 as a possible inspiration for the horse-racing incident in Episode 5. Zimmer, however, attributes this detail to Scandinavian influences.⁴

Actual proof of the presence of classical reminiscence of this sort, however, would not be definitive in its bearing upon our problem, because nothing would be more natural than for a learned Irish writer of the period to incorporate, in a story belonging to a type of native origin and growth, certain situations which he had come upon in classical stories, especially if he found them in pieces similar in

¹ Examples in the older stories appear in *Bran* and in *Echtra Condla Chaim*, "The Adventures of Connla." For a translation of *Connla* into German, see Thurneysen, *Sagen aus dem alten Irland*, pp. 73-80; for one into French, see D'Arbois de Jubainville, *Cours*, V, 385 ff. The trait in question of course appears in later stories, e.g., *Laoidh Oisín ar Thír na n-Óg*, "The Lay of Oisín on the Land of Youths" (*Transactions Ossianic Society*, IV [1856, printed 1859], 234 ff.).

² The account of the Cyclops in *Merugud Uilix maicc Leirtis*, "The Wandering of Ulysses, son of Laertes" (ed. Kuno Meyer [London, 1886], pp. 18-20), is so different in detail from the *Odyssey* account—though like it in general outlines—as to make it certain that the Irish narrator did not work from a copy of the *Odyssey*. The piece occurs in Stowe MS 992, written 1300 A.D.

³ *An Irish Precursor of Dante* (London, 1908), p. 152.

⁴ *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 324.

character to his own composition. That the presence of a non-Celtic trait here and there in a Celtic tale does not affect the essentially Celtic character of the story is a point that has already been made.¹

Zimmer finds his closest parallels to the *Aeneid* in *Maelduin* and the early section of *Húi Corra*, which, it will be recalled, he regards as the oldest bits of *imram* literature, the early section of *Húi Corra* antedating *Maelduin*. The episodic material, he says, is drawn mainly from Irish sagas of the pagan period, preserved in the recollections of the people through the classical period, partly from classical reminiscence and partly from the accounts of the experiences of Irish fishermen and anchorites. The peculiar structural form of the stories is due to the use of the *Aeneid* as a pattern by some "*irischen Vergile*."² This last contention he supports by drawing the following parallels:

1. Aeneas consults an augury at the beginning of his journey (*Aeneid* iii. 79). So Maelduin, before beginning his voyage, goes to Corcomroe to consult the druid Nuca.

2. The account of the amorous queen (*Maelduin*, Episode 28), though Irish material, shows Vergilian influence in mode of treatment. The "first lady" of the island of women in such stories as *Connla* and *Bran* is transformed into a widowed queen in *Maelduin* in imitation of Dido. The mistresses of Bran and Connla are unmarried, ever young in their loves: "was macht nun der verf. von Imram Maelduin daraus? eine königswittwe—Didos verstorbener gemahl hiess Sychaeus—mit 17 töchtern; sie herrscht über ein grosses volk und ist täglich von ihren herrscherpflichten in anspruch genommen. dem Maelduin sagt sie: 'bleibt hier, und nicht soll alter über euch kommen als das alter, in dem ihr seid, und ewiges leben immerdar wird euch sein.' dies ist alte anschauung von *tír namban*. dann erzählt sie, dass ihr mann, dem sie 17 töchter geboren, gestorben sei! natürlich, nur so konnte eine wittwe wie Dido herauskommen; wäre nicht eine nachahmung beabsichtigt, so wäre der krasse widerspruch unerklärlich. nur die nachahmung der mächtigen königin konnte dazu führen, auf *inís namban* ausser den frauen noch ein grosses volk zu denken. ferner: Maelduin hatte ein jahr lang die königin, die mutter von 17 erwachsenen töchtern als bettgenossin, während seine gefährten sich in die jungen mädchen teilten. Bran erhält als führer natürlich auch die erste unter den frauen (*taisech namban*), aber dies war keine mutter von 17 töchtern, sondern ein ewig junges weib wie die anderen. die scenen, wie die königin den Maelduin zurückzuhalten sucht,

¹ T. P. Cross, *R.C.*, XXXI (1910), 429. Cross refers also to Schofield, *PMLA*, XVI, (1901), 424.

² Zimmer's phrase, *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 328.

sind aus irischem material; es ist die schilderung verwertet, wie Bran landet. gewaltsame versuche, den Bran zurückzuhalten, werden nicht gemacht, offenbar weil der sage nur freiwilliges verweilen im lande der frauen entspricht. auch diese umgestaltung muss einen zweck gehabt haben, welcher wie der aller umgestaltungen der alten sage in der beabsichtigten nachahmung Vergils zu suchen ist."¹

3. Aeneas, before meeting Dido, meets a countryman, Helenus, who is also a seer and utters a prophecy concerning the outcome of the journey. Likewise Maelduin, before reaching the isle of the widowed queen (Episode 28), meets a countryman who prophesies as to the outcome of the voyage (Episode 19). Similarly, after leaving Dido and before reaching Italy, Aeneas meets a countryman, Acestes. Likewise Maelduin, after leaving the isle of women and before reaching Ireland, meets another countryman (Episode 30).

4. Between the visits to Helenus and Dido, Aeneas has the adventure with Polyphemus and the Cyclops. So Maelduin, between the visit to the first countryman (Episode 19) and to the widowed queen (Episode 28), has the adventure with the smiths (Episode 21). Further, the questioning smith in *Maelduin* is thought of as blind. Traits in Episode 13 (Giant Herdsman) may also be classical reminiscences from the same sources.

5. Between the visit to Acestes and the reaching of the limit of the journey by Aeneas lies the death of Palinurus (*Aeneid* v. 827 ff.). Likewise Maelduin, between the visit to his countryman (Episode 30) and the reaching of his goal (Episode 34), loses his third foster-brother (Episode 31). The peculiar circumstance that in *Maelduin* three men later join the crew and die upon the trip, while in *Húi Corra* one follows and dies, can be understood if both narratives be regarded as written under the influence, or after the pattern, of the *Aeneid*. The naked buffoon who implores the Húi Corra, as they prepare for their trip, to take him along "for God's sake," corresponds to the wretched follower of Ulysses who abjured the departing Aeneas *per sidera* to take him. During the whole seven-year journey of Aeneas only one of the hero's companions meets an unnatural death, namely, Palinurus, who is the sacrifice demanded by Neptune. Now if one grants that an Irish scholar introduced the notion that Palinurus must die to make up for the additional member of the crew taken on [the Odyssean wretch], then the Irish imitations of the journey of Aeneas are clear. The association of the loss of Palinurus with the taking on of the follower of Ulysses serves as the basis for the incident in *Húi Corra*, and makes clear to us how the author of *Maelduin* came to have three additional journeyers figure in the story instead of one. The addition is a variation by the author of *Maelduin* for which he perhaps puzzled out a justification from Vergil: only one man, Palinurus, dies an unnatural death during the journey, and that toward its close; about

¹ ZFDA, XXXIII, 328-29.

the middle of the trip Anchises dies, and at the beginning of the trip stands the incident of the unfortunate Polydorus, dying, as it were, a second time; so one may speak of three deaths, during the journey, of persons closely associated with the hero. Corresponding to this, under the hypothesis created by *Húi Corra* as to the cause of the death of one companion, three additional journeyers must be taken aboard in *Maelduin*.

Such is Zimmer's case. The argument for the influence of the *Aeneid* resolves itself into two main contentions: that the incident of the amorous queen in *Maelduin* was molded by the Dido-Aeneas story (point 2); and that *Maelduin* and the old (lost) version of *Húi Corra* derive their structural form from the *Aeneid* (points 1, 3, 4, 5). Neither contention seems convincing.

The suggestion that Maelduin's mistress is a Celtic fairy transformed into a Dido is neither a necessary nor a plausible explanation of her character. Although Zimmer refers to her as a fairy creature, his argument ignores her essentially fairy character. That a Celtic fairy mistress, the mother of seventeen grown daughters, is still desirable is not at all strange, because by her nature she is immortally young. In *Tochmarc Étaíne*, "Wooing of Etain," a very old story, Etain must have been more than a thousand years old while being quarreled over by her lovers.¹ In *Acallamh na Senórach*, "Colloquy of Old Men" (11, 3893 ff.), which, though late material, doubtless preserves a mass of early tradition, Caeilte explains to Patrick that their young fairy visitor is "of the *tuatha dé danaan*, who are unfading and whose duration is perennial."²

The widowhood and queenship of Maelduin's mistress Zimmer thinks due to the use of Dido as a model. But the first ladies in the Irish Otherworld stories of the *Bran* and *Connla* type are all queens, and Fand in *Serglige Conculaind*,³ "The Sickbed of Cuchullin," is not only a queen, but a "grass widow": she has been divorced by Manannan before becoming Cuchullin's mistress. Maelduin's companions must have mistresses. These mistresses must be subordinated to Maelduin's mistress. Making them daughters is a

¹ A. H. Leahy, *Heroic Romances*, I, 8.

² Stokes ed., *Irische Texte*, IV, 1. The quotation is from O'Grady's translation in *Silva Gadelica*, II (1892), 203.

³ Leahy, *Heroic Romances*, I, 57 ff. This story also furnishes a parallel for the presence of other persons than women in the island elysium, a feature in *Maelduin* which Zimmer attributes to the influence of the *Aeneid*. The shorter *Fled Bricrend* supplies another example.

simple device for the purpose. Since all were fairy women, the conception carried no incongruity. Moreover, it is questionable whether a conscious imitator would change a Celtic mistress into a widow to make her like Dido, and almost in the same breath give her seventeen daughters, a markedly un-Didoesque characteristic.

Although the reluctance of Maelduin's mistress to allow her lover to leave her is somewhat more pronounced than the similar attitudes of the mistresses in other Irish sagas, the difference seems purely one of degree. Instead of contenting herself with a warning to the mortal that he would rue an attempt to return to his former abode, as in *Bran*, the lady takes active steps to prevent the return. For this purpose she uses precisely the device Bran's mistress had used to entice Bran to her isle. The inversion of the function of the clew incident, or rather the change in its position in the story, may be due to a confusion on the part of some writer, or to a desire for variety. It is not impossible that the inversion accounts for the seeming parallel to Dido's behavior—a process the very reverse of that supposed by Zimmer. It is to be remembered, too, that there is no sufficient evidence to show any direct relationship between *Bran* and *Maelduin*.¹ The fairy's effort to retain her lover needs no resort to sophisticated literature for an explanation, inasmuch as the inability of the mortal captured by the fairies to return to his former sphere of existence is a recognized trait in fairy lore.² The maleficent powers of fairy creatures were, of course, understood. In *Echtra Condla Chaim* King Conn tries to dispel, by resorting to druids, the invisible fairy lady who is trying to entice away his son Connla.³

Zimmer rests his argument for structural imitation upon the citation of supposedly parallel incidents appearing at corresponding stages of the journeys of Aeneas and Maelduin. The author whose organizing hand is responsible for the *Maelduin* narrative in substantially its present form is, therefore, the man who worked under Vergilian influence. This consideration is important, because it forces the rejection, by any advocate of Zimmer's theory, of most forms of the theory of composite origin. The delicate mechanism

¹ Cf. Nutt, *op. cit.*, I, 172.

² Hartland, *Science of Fairy Tales* (New York, 1891), pp. 43, 47, 196 ff.

³ Thurneysen, *op. cit.*, p. 75.

devised for the story by the author, who, under stress of Vergilian influence, placed his incidents with such extreme care (note especially points 3, 4, and 5), could scarcely have survived if later narrators or transcribers had done much in the way of addition or alteration. Nor could a holder of Zimmer's view admit the supposition that a single author, working under Vergilian influence, gave final form to a story already existing; for such a hypothesis would assume the practically complete development of the type before the operation of the supposed foreign influence. Features showing the alleged influence of the *Aeneid*, such as the presence of the foster-brothers, intimately connected as they are with the taboo motive, seem too important organically to admit an assumption that they were inserted by a compiler who was trying to inject a Vergilian flavor into an already existing story.

Yet the theory of composite origin must be looked upon with favor. The crude accumulation of wonders and adventures, obvious to any reader, and the striking repetition of situations and motives, surely seem to support it. Nutt¹ and Brown² find traces of several damsel-land stories which have been put together by the compiler of *Maelduin*. Some repetitions of detail may be noted: a cleric clothed only in his hair, Episodes 19, 20, 30, and 33; almost the whole of Episode 19 reappears in Episode 20; trees with birds, Episodes 3, 10, 18, and 19; subaqueous entrance, 6 and 27; miraculous supply of salmon, 6 and 25; cheeselike food having any desired savour, 16 and 17; gradual miraculous enlargement of an island, 19 and 33; vanishing of Otherworld as mortals sleep, 16 and 17; beds for "every three," 6 and 17; island inhabitants overheard talking of visitors' approach, 21, 24, and 34; missiles cast at voyagers, 4, 8, and 24. The confusion in the number of the company and the slip in twice recording the loss of a "third" foster-brother (Episodes 11 and 31) also suggest the compilatory character of the account. The druid had suggested sixty (the number found in *Brendan*) as the required number of the crew; but it is evident that the sixty has been changed

¹ *Op. cit.*, I, 164 ff.

² *Op. cit.*, VIII (1903), 66-69. Brown prints a table dividing the story into five groups, in each of which he finds the repetition of certain stock features of the Celtic Otherworld journey. Group IV (Eps. 18-28) he regards as the original kernel of the whole, or as the most complete of several variants put together to make a whole. Cf. also *Mod. Phil.*, XIV (1916), 388.

to sixteen, for in Episode 28, after the loss of two of the foster-brothers, the hero has seventeen companions.

Although almost any theory of the compilatory nature of *Maelduin* would seem hostile to Zimmer's contentions, it is possible to suggest a process of composite origin that would still admit of a Vergil-inspired author-compiler. We may suppose that the author had before him various stories of Otherworld adventures, perhaps of the type of *Bran* or *Connla* or *Serglige Conculaind*, in none of which was there any pronounced stressing of the distinctive *imram* trait of rowing about almost endlessly from island to island. Each story contained a single Otherworld, the furniture of which, as Brown suggests, the *Maelduin* author distributed among the various islands he included in his descriptions. In the process of assembling these materials he made use of the *Aeneid* pattern. Later transcribers could not be assumed to have made any radical changes.¹

Perhaps a query concerning the psychological processes involved in Zimmer's theory of the composition of *Maelduin* and the old *Húi Corra* is not out of place before an examination is made of Zimmer's structural argument in detail. Did the Irish Vergil expect his audience to recognize his imitation of the Aeneas story? If not, why the imitation? Could it be that a delicate sense for the niceties of structural art impelled him to satisfy his own artistic conscience by following, however vaguely so far as his reader was concerned, certain structural features of his model? It may be answered that the failure of the alleged borrowings to redeem the story from the blemish of a lack of fine literary form, the presence of tiresome and awkward repetitions, and the failure to take from the supposed model structural points of really significant character, argue against the assumption of such a personality. It is also hard to believe that the author was a superstitious fellow who thought the sly insertion of unrecognizable Vergilian traits would somehow add to the attractiveness of his story.

If Vergil were as popular in Ireland as Zimmer argues,² and the author of *Maelduin* consciously imitated Vergil, he most certainly

¹ Yet Nutt thinks additions and interpolations may have been made as late as the tenth century (*op. cit.*, I, 163, n. 1), and Brown accepts this view (*Mod. Phil.*, XIV, 388).

² *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 326-27.

would have made such borrowings as he would expect to be recognized. It seems indeed strange, therefore, that the borrowings should have remained unnoticed, so far as is known, for more than a thousand years. Zimmer appears to have been the first to detect them. The succeeding *imram* writers seem not to have preserved the "Vergilian" features. One would at least expect some Vergilian traits to show in *Húi Corra*. Zimmer thinks that the early part of this *imram* was written under Vergilian influence, and that the naked buffoon is a counterpart of Achaemenides. The motive of the resort to a druid, present in *Maelduin* because of Aeneas' consulting of the oracle, does not appear in *Húi Corra*. Since it would necessarily come earlier in the story than the buffoon incident, which the old section of *Húi Corra* extends far enough to include, this trait could not have been in the original version. There are no smiths in *Húi Corra*. There is no single hero. There is no love affair. The single appearance of the land of women (Episode 54) is like Episodes 16 and 17 of *Maelduin* rather than Episode 28. There is no approach to the Aeneas-Dido situation. The deaths on the trip occur in the same part of the story (Episodes 44-48). The *Húi Corra* do meet clerics, perhaps their countrymen, at various stages of their journey, one just before Episode 54, and many in the latter part of the story. They meet two prophets—a woman in Episode 54, and an old cleric in Episode 73. The structure of the other late *imrama* is quite as loose as that of *Húi Corra*, and it is useless to apply the Vergilian tests.¹

To determine whether or not there is in *Maelduin* the close imitation of structure assumed by Zimmer it is necessary to compare the whole trend of events in the two stories. The unlike parts are

¹ C. Wahlund (*Brendans Meerfahrt* [Upsala, 1900], p. xxvii), apparently adopting Zimmer's view concerning possible Vergilian inspiration for the *imrama*, regards the visit to the priest Ende, the island of smiths, and the death of the third monk in *Navigatio Brendani* as reminiscences of the *Aeneid* (cf. Zimmer's points 1, 4, and 5). They can scarcely be more than reminiscences of *Maelduin*, however, and are so regarded by some scholars (Zimmer, *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 321; Bosér, *Romania*, XXII, 582-83). In any event, these parallels seem inadequate for proving conscious imitation of the *Aeneid* by the author of the *Navigatio*.

When some centuries later the author of the "Irish *Aeneid*" (ed. Calder, *Irish Texts Society*, VI [1903, printed 1907]), wrote the version of Vergil's poem preserved in the Book of Ballymote (ca. 1400), his reaction on the *Aeneid* material was totally different from that assumed by Zimmer for the author of *Maelduin*. He took great liberties with the structure of the poem (Book iii is placed before Book i), and actually omitted Dido's account of her previous history, the passage which Zimmer thinks so impressed the author of *Maelduin* that under its influence he made a Dido out of a Celtic fairy mistress. Cf. T. H. Williams, *C.Z.*, II (1888-89), 419-72.

scarcely less eloquent than the alleged like parts in the consideration of structural similarities. The following summary of Vergil's account of Aeneas, with Zimmer's "parallels" indicated, will perhaps aid in estimating the significance of Zimmer's argument.

AENEID

BOOK III

After the destruction of Troy Aeneas and his companions, under the guidance of the gods, determine to seek distant retreats, and hoist sails at the command of Anchises. They are uncertain whither the Fates will them to go. They are carried to Thrace.

Mæld. Ep. 11.—When Aeneas would build his city, blood flows from a tree and the voice of Polydorus speaks, reciting his murder at the hands of the Thracians and warning Aeneas to flee.

Mæld. Introd.—The hero next reaches Delos, governed by King Anius, a priest of Apollo. In answer to prayer, Apollo bids Aeneas search out his ancient mother-soil, where his descendants shall enjoy a universal kingdom. Anchises thinks Crete is meant by the oracle.

Thither Aeneas sails, and builds a city. But a plague wastes his people. In a vision Aeneas hears from his household gods that Italy, not Crete, was meant by Apollo. Cassandra's prophecy is recalled. After enduring a three-day storm, Aeneas is driven to the Strophades, where his men offer violence to the attacking Harpies, and Celaeno predicts that the Trojans in famine shall eat their own tables. Actium is visited, where Trojan games are celebrated by the voyagers.

Mæld. Ep. 19.—At Buthrotum Aeneas meets Andromache and Helenus. The latter, a prophet of Apollo, tells the hero he must seek the farther shore of Italy, avoid Scylla and Charybdis, appease Juno, and visit the Cumæan sibyl.

Mæld. Ep. 21.—The next morning the Trojans salute Italy, cruise past Italian towns and Mt. Etna, and after a stormy night reach the coasts of the Cyclops, where Achaemenides, the comrade of Ulysses, in piteous plight tells the tale of Ulysses and Polyphemus, and begs mercy of the Trojans. Polyphemus is seen. In terror Aeneas rescues Achaemenides and sails southward, escaping the throng of giants who gather on the shore.

Mæld. Ep. 15.—Skirting the Sicilian coast, Aeneas comes to Drepanum, where Anchises dies. Aeneas ceases his narration.

BOOK IV

Mæld. Ep. 28 (compare Book iv entire).—Queen Dido conceives a deep passion for Aeneas and, encouraged by her sister Anna, strives to get the gods to approve the breaking of her vow. Juno, active in Dido's behalf, with Venus' aid brings Aeneas and Dido together in a cave during a storm.

Dido proclaims her marriage. Fame spreads abroad the disgrace of the queen. The jealous King Iarbas prays to Jove for revenge. Mercury delivers to Aeneas Jove's command that the Trojans leave Carthage. Aeneas secretly prepares to go, but Dido divines his purpose and, inflamed to madness, reproaches the hero and begs him to remain. Aeneas pleads the command of Jove. Dido in scorn vows vengeance. Aeneas continues preparations for departure. Dido's mood changes, and she sends Anna to Aeneas to beg him to remain, at least for a time. Dido longs for death, and, under pretence of resorting to magic, prepares a funeral pile on the shore. Warned by Mercury, Aeneas suddenly sets sail. Dido describes the retreating fleet and wildly orders her people to prepare to pursue the Trojans. Realizing the madness of the project, she falls into a rage, regretting that she had not taken the life of Aeneas while he was in her power. She prays that Carthage may be the scourge and foe of Italy, and seeks her bed to fall upon her sword. Juno sends Iris to cut the thread that holds soul and body together.

BOOK V

Mæld. Ep. 30.—The Trojans see from their ships the flames of Dido's funeral pyre. A storm compels Aeneas to turn aside to Sicily. Here he is hospitably entertained by his countryman Acestes. Aeneas celebrates funeral games on the anniversary of the death of Anchises. As they worship, a beautiful snake glides harmlessly over the altar. It is perhaps the familiar spirit of Anchises. The games are then celebrated: boat race, foot race, boxing match, archery, and the game of Troy. The Trojan women, inspired by Juno with dissatisfaction, set fire to the ships. Jove sends rain to save the fleet.

By the advice of Nautes the disheartened Aeneas resolves to leave the old and faint-hearted in Sicily. The spirit of Anchises in a vision gives similar advice and tells the hero to visit him in Elysium. Segesta is founded and a temple to Venus erected. The women, penitent, sorrow on being left behind. In response to Venus' prayer, Neptune promises safety to all but one.

Mæld. Ep. 31.—On the voyage the god of sleep brings drowsiness upon the pilot Palinurus, who falls into the sea. In the morning Aeneas himself turns pilot.

Obviously the structural similarity of the two accounts as wholes is not striking. A closer resemblance, involving a larger number of parallels, would seem necessary to give color to Zimmer's hypothesis.

Moreover, the closeness of the parallels themselves (points 1, 3, 4, and 5) must be questioned.

1. Aeneas' consultation of the oracle and Maelduin's resort to the druid present situations which are entirely dissimilar. Aeneas

does not consult the oracle before his trip; he has been on his journey for some months, has attempted to establish his seat in Thrace, and has taken the second lap of his sea journey before he reaches the island where he consults the oracle. Moreover, Aeneas makes no voluntary trip to get into touch with a supernatural agency. He is driven by the winds upon an island, and finds there a shrine of Apollo. Quite naturally he seeks light. Maelduin's visit to Nuca, on the contrary, is voluntary and is made before the beginning of the sea journey. The requests of the two heroes are totally different. Aeneas prays for help in establishing a lasting home, and asks for guidance in achieving his destiny. Maelduin, who plans a voyage of vengeance and desires to know where to find his father's murderer, fails to make any inquiry concerning the large issues of his enterprise; he merely secures from the druid a charm and information concerning the building of a boat, the date for starting, and the number of companions to take.

Furthermore, a more likely source of the incident is suggested by the fact that resort to druids for aid and for prophetic information is not infrequent in Irish traditional literature. In *Táin Bó Cúailnge*,¹ "The Cattle Raid of Cooley," the druid Cathbad is consulted as to the omens of the day. In the same story the "poets and druids" cause the troop of Medb to wait a fortnight for a good omen before starting out on their expedition.² In *Forbais Droma Damhghaire*,³ "The Siege of Drom Damhghaire," Cormac consults druids on the probable success of an expedition into Munster. The druids tell him the best methods of defeating the enemy. Druidic aid is also sought in *Tochmarc Étaíne*,⁴ in *Tairired na nDéssi*,⁵ "Expulsion of the Dessi," in *Cath Maighe Mucraimhe*,⁶ "The Battle of Magh Mucrimhe," and in other old stories. There is also an example in *Cóir Anmann*,⁷ "The Fitness of Names." In the shorter *Fled Bricrend*⁸ (*Fled Bricrend ocus Loinges mac n-Duil Dermait*, "The

¹ Trans. L. W. Faraday (London, 1904), p. 26.

² *Ibid.*, p. 2.

³ O'Curry, *Manuscript Materials* (Dublin, 1878), pp. 271-72.

⁴ Leahy, *Heroic Romances*, I, 7 ff.

⁵ Kuno Meyer, *Y Cymmrodor*, XIV (1901), 101 ff.

⁶ *R.C.*, XIII (1893), 426 ff.

⁷ *Irische Texte*, III, 303.

⁸ Trans. Windisch, *Irische Texte*, II, 1, 196.

Feast of Brieriu and the Exile of the Sons of Doel Dermait"), Cuchullin is offered a sea charm such as Maelduin seems to have sought from the druid Nuca. Moreover, he is about to take and does take a successful voyage to a land of wonders. Clearly there is no necessity for supposing a foreign source for the notion of Maelduin's resort to the druid.

3. That Aeneas and Maelduin meet countrymen at corresponding stages of their journeys may be entirely accidental. No very peculiar or similar situations are involved. In a story of wanderings at sea, the meeting of someone from home is a simple, natural device which any story-teller might use, its narrative function being to remind the reader or hearer of the hero's connection with a real, non-romantic world. The device is particularly fitting in *Maelduin*, as the hero is finally to be brought back to Ireland. All the countrymen are clerics who have undergone some outstanding religious experience. That they enact the rôle of prophets needs no recourse to classical paganism for an explanation. In the eighth century, the probable period of *Maelduin*, stories of the experiences of sea anchorites, based probably upon fact,¹ had long been current.

If the encountering of countrymen, moreover, is included in *Maelduin* in imitation of the *Aeneid*, and the instances carefully placed at corresponding stages of the hero's progress, how are we to explain Maelduin's meeting with the countryman in Episode 33, for which Zimmer could find no suggestion of a parallel in the journey of Aeneas? According to Zimmer's hypothesis, we are compelled to regard two of the three meetings with countrymen as significant, and one as not significant. It is difficult to look with favor on such an arbitrary argumentative procedure as this.

4. As Zimmer recognizes, his argument on this point involves the assumption that the author of *Maelduin*, though influenced directly by the *Aeneid* in including the episode of the giant smiths and in determining its place in the story, drew upon his knowledge of Homer for the details of the incident. Two essential points in the

¹ Schirmer (*op. cit.*, p. 21, n. 4) and Zimmer touch on this matter and quote Dicuil, *De Mensura Terrarum* (825 A.D.), "Sunt aliae insulae multae in septentrionali Britanniae oceano; duorum dierum ac noctium recta navigatione, plenis velis, assiduo feliciter vento, adiri queunt . . . in quibus, in centum ferme annis, eremitae ex nostra Scotia navigantes habitaverunt." See also Plummer, *op. cit.*, I, cxxii.

parallel, the throwing of rocks and the conception of the Cyclops as blind, must have come, not from Vergil, but from the *Odyssey* ix. 107 ff. and 539 ff.

Zimmer says that a careful reading of the Irish account reveals the fact that the chief smith is conceived of as blind, a circumstance which makes the parallel seem much closer. An analysis of the incident makes this inference seem groundless:

The voyagers hear a smiting of anvils. They hear Smith Number 1 ask Smith Number 2, "Are they close at hand?" Number 2 answers, "Yea." Smith Number 3 says, "Who are these ye say are coming here?" Number 2 describes the strangers. Then the smith at the forge, who is apparently the leader (probably Number 1, possibly Number 3), asks, "Are they now near the harbour?" Number 2, this time referred to as the "watchman," replies that they do not seem to be drawing nearer. Again the questioner at the forge inquires, "What are they doing now?" "I think," says the "lookout man," "that they are running away." The smith at the forge now steps forth and casts a mass of molten metal after the boat. The cast falls short, and the strangers continue successfully their retreat, with the stern of their boat turned out to sea.

There is no necessity for supposing this chief smith to be blind. Number 2 is quite plainly a regular sentinel, and the other smiths, including the chief smith, are evidently so placed that they cannot see the boat. The chief smith is at work at his forge, perhaps hidden behind a rock or in a cave (he is said to "come forth" from the forge before making the cast), and having been made aware of the approach of the strangers he interrogates his lookout man, from time to time, as to their movements. If the Irish author thought of this smith as blind, it is strange that he did not so describe him and that he made no use of the motive. Also it seems hardly likely—though it is possible, as the giant is an Otherworld giant—that the author would conceive of the smith as compelled by blindness to make inquiries concerning the strangers' position, and yet be able to hurl his missile with almost deadly aim. Fairy giants, of course, appear elsewhere in Celtic literature.¹

¹ In the older stories examples are: *Fled Bricrend* (*ITS*, II, 47 ff.); *Tochmarc Emere*, "The Wooing of Emere" (Hull, *Cuchullin Saga*, 81 [Fomorí]); and the shorter *Fled Bricrend* (Island-inhabiting giants). In Fenian literature giants are quite numerous: in the *Gilla Decair* (trans. O'Grady, *Silva Gadelica*, II, 292 ff.) there is an oversea giant; in *Find and the Phantoms* (*R.C.*, VII [1886], 297) there is a hostile Otherworld giant. See also *Agallamh na Senórach*, *Silva Gadelica*, II, 103 ff.

5. Zimmer's effort to force a parallel between the deaths of Palinurus and Maelduin's third foster-brother leads him into what is perhaps the most fantastic of all his arguments. In order to appreciate fully the gratuitous ingenuity of Zimmer's hypothesis, one must remember that Zimmer regards the lost original version of *Húi Corra* as older than *Maelduin* and composed, like *Maelduin*, under the influence of the *Aeneid*. He does not regard the two stories as written by the same author. The creator of *Maelduin* then is not the pioneer in devising an Irish imitation of the *Aeneid*; he is merely attempting to out-Vergil the earlier Irish Vergil. His predecessor had interpreted the death of Palinurus as due to the addition of Achaemenides to the crew. The author of *Maelduin*, accepting this stupid interpretation of Vergil,¹ resolves to improve on the idea by introducing three additional men, and finds justification in the commonly admired *Aeneid* by resorting to the incidents of the death of Anchises and the Polydorus-bleeding-tree affair! All this in spite of the fact that Anchises was a member of the original crew, and that Polydorus never belonged to the crew at all, but was in fact dead before Aeneas began his journey. But the author of *Maelduin* is not to be daunted by these incongruities. He puzzles out a justification by thinking of Polydorus as dying, so to speak, a second time. Surely it is unnecessary to resort to such a theory of composition to explain so simple an amplification of the story as the addition of three members of the crew, destined as they are to be lost because of the violation of the taboo, instead of the addition of a single member.²

The testimony of the poem itself on the point of authorship would seem to be of little value at present in determining the origin

¹ I find nothing in Vergil to warrant the supposition that the death of Palinurus was a necessary consequence of the taking on of Achaemenides. Neptune takes the life as an atonement, in order to preserve the lives of the rest:

"Unus erit tantum, amissum quem gurgite quaeres;
Unum pro multis dabitur caput." [*Aeneid* v. 814-15.]

Even admitting this forced interpretation, however, there is no true parallel to *Húi Corra*, because in the latter, as in the corresponding incidents in *Maelduin*, the additional voyager is himself the one to die.

² The especial fondness of the Celts for triads is in itself a sufficient explanation, if coupled with a desire to expand a good story. See the collection of Irish triads, ed. and trans. Kuno Meyer, *Royal Irish Academy, Todd Lecture Series*, XIII (Dublin, 1906). See also the collection of Welsh triads in J. Loth, *Les Mabinogion*, II (Paris, 1913), 223 ff. and *ibid.*, I, Intr., 76-77. In *Maelduin* itself the visits to successive islands are nearly all separated by "three days and nights." There are beds for "every three" in Eps. 6 and 17. In *Bran* the crew is divided into three companies to each of which Bran assigns a leader. One of these leaders is a foster-brother of the hero.

of *Maelduin*. The closing sentence of the story, "Now Aed the Fair, chief sage of Ireland, arranged this story as it standeth here, etc.," occurs only in the youngest of the four manuscript sources, Egerton 1782, which, according to Stokes, is not earlier than the fifteenth century.¹ Stokes² and Zimmer³ find trace of but one *Aed Finn* in the annals. This man was chief of the Dal Riata, died in 771, and was "more probably given," says Stokes, "to making raids and beheading his foes than to composing imaginative literature."

It appears natural to regard the *imram* as an outgrowth of native narrative materials and forms, wrought into its typical structural form through natural processes by native story-tellers who embellished their tales from time to time, drawing new material from any sources that presented themselves. In a later paper I hope to present evidence of a direct nature in support of this hypothesis.

WILLIAM FLINT THRALL

McKENDREE COLLEGE

¹ *R.C.*, IX, 448.

² *Ibid.*, p. 447.

³ *ZFDA*, XXXIII, 290-92.